# REPORT OF THE ASSISTANT CHIEF EXECUTIVE - PERFORMANCE 

# CATALOGUE SUPPLIES SERVICE JOINT COMMITTEE 

14 JULY 2011

## COUNTY BOROUGH SUPPLIES

## 1. Purpose of Report

1.1 The purpose of the report is to provide the Committee with an update on developments in relation to the current trading position and the future viability of the Joint Supplies Service.
2. Connection to Corporate Improvement Objectives / Other Corporate Priorities.
2.1 The Joint Supplies Service provides a one stop purchasing facility for each of the partnering Authorities, through delivery via stores and a direct sourcing function for items of common and repetitive spend. It demonstrates savings to corporate customers and schools through economies of scale, which can be used in service delivery.

## 3. Background

3.1 Concern has been expressed by Members regarding the long term viability of County Borough Supplies, which culminated in a review of the service by APSE which was concluded in August 2008.
3.2 The main conclusion of the review was that the service could not continue to return an annual surplus, in its then form and a number of options were proposed.
3.3 These were considered by Members and Officers and two of the options proposed were taken forward. These were modernisation of the service and the pursuit of sales growth in the Neath Port Talbot and Swansea areas.
3.4 The modernisation programme focussed on the development of the Service website, linked with the e-trading platform within Xchange Wales, and the ability to accept purchasing card payment from end users.

This was seen to offer added value services to existing and potential customers whilst increasing efficiency within the business per se.
3.5 In addition, a focussed marketing campaign has been undertaken to increase the level of business opportunity in the target areas of Neath Port Talbot and Swansea

A service business plan was agreed in February 2010 and progress has been regularly monitored through the Officer Group and reported to Members on a quarterly basis.

## 4. Current Situation / Proposal

4.1 At the Joint Committee meeting on $23^{\text {rd }}$ September 2010, Members were alerted to a sudden downturn in turnover and income, which took effect from June 2010. A number of factors accounted for this, including:
> Planned growth in the Neath Port Talbot and Swansea areas had not achieved the predicted growth levels.
$>$ Following the national election, there had been reduced expenditure generally, and in particular a downturn in capital expenditure.
$>$ A reduction in the independent sector spend and the loss of a major customer.
$>$ The potential for the customer base to curtail spending following the Comprehensive Spending Review.
4.2 Revised growth targets were set in October 2010, reducing the levels previously set, which were combined with planned cutbacks in operating expenditure, and the second phase of the modernisation programme was deferred.
4.3 A report submitted to the Joint Supplies Committee on $16^{\text {th }}$ March 2011, outlined a better trading position, albeit showing a ten percent deficit compared with the original target for $2010 / 11$ of $£ 6.25$ million.
4.3.1 The final outturn for the $2010 / 11$ financial year is shown in the following table.

\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline \[
\begin{gathered}
\hline \text { Actual } \\
2009 / 10 \\
£ 000
\end{gathered}
\] \& Income \& \[
\begin{gathered}
\text { Revised } \\
\text { Budget } \\
2010 / 11 \\
£ 000
\end{gathered}
\] \& \[
\begin{gathered}
\hline \text { Actual } \\
2010 / 11 \\
£ 000
\end{gathered}
\] \& \[
\begin{gathered}
\hline \text { Variance } \\
2010 / 11 \\
£ 000
\end{gathered}
\] \\
\hline \[
\begin{array}{r}
\hline(1,143) \\
(192)
\end{array}
\] \& Catalogue Sales (net) Other income * \& \[
\begin{array}{r}
(1,226) \\
(190) \\
\hline
\end{array}
\] \& \[
\begin{array}{r}
\hline(1121) \\
(187) \\
\hline
\end{array}
\] \& 105
3 \\
\hline \((1,335)\) \& Total Income \& \((1,416)\) \& \((1,308)\) \& 108 \\
\hline \[
\begin{array}{r}
925 \\
96 \\
68 \\
197 \\
3 \\
34 \\
1 \\
3
\end{array}
\] \& \begin{tabular}{l}
Expenditure \\
Employees \\
Premises \\
Transport \\
Supplies \& Services \\
Third Party Payments \\
Support Services \\
Finance Charges \\
Increase in Bad Debt Provision
\end{tabular} \& \[
\begin{array}{r}
977 \\
82 \\
119 \\
161 \\
9 \\
36 \\
- \\
2
\end{array}
\] \& \[
\begin{array}{r}
903 \\
87 \\
107 \\
169 \\
5 \\
37 \\
- \\
3
\end{array}
\] \& \((74)\)
5
\((12)\)
8
\((4)\)
1

1 <br>
\hline 1,327 \& Total Expenditure \& 1,386 \& 1311 \& (75) <br>
\hline (8) \& (SURPLUS)/ DEFICIT FOR
YEAR \& (30) \& 3 \& 33 <br>
\hline
\end{tabular}

4.4 The financial position as at 31 March 2011 showed an over-spend on service expenditure within the year of $£ 3 \mathrm{k}$. This includes the modernisation costs of $£ 39 \mathrm{k}$ which are required to be shown in the Income \& Expenditure Account, but have been funded from earmarked reserves. Were it not for this one-off item the trading results for the year would have shown a £36k surplus.
4.5 Members will note some significant variances from budget which are attributable to:
$>$ An under-recovery in Catalogue Sales income of $£ 105 \mathrm{k}$ due to anticipated growth in sales not being achieved together with higher purchase prices during the year resulting in a consequential reduction to overall sales margins.
$>$ A net under-spend of $£ 74 \mathrm{k}$ on employee's expenditure as a result of staff vacancies, no turnover/resources growth, and multiple maternities during the year.
$>$ A net under-spend of $£ 12 k$ on transport costs in respect of external hire, fuel costs and car allowances. The transport budget has been reprofiled to include carrier expenditure which had previously been included within supplies and services, printing \& stationery (carriage). A budget of $£ 30 \mathrm{k}$ relating to carrier costs was previously held within Supplies \& Services.
$>$ A net overspend of $£ 8 \mathrm{k}$ on supplies and services costs. Supplies \& Services expenditure includes $£ 39 \mathrm{k}$ which it was agreed would be funded from earmarked reserves and not the planned Revenue Budget.
> Other income includes a $£ 29 \mathrm{k}$ rebate not included in the Service Business Plan.

## Market Analysis

4.6 An appraisal of the customer base and commodity income recovery has been undertaken to ascertain the continued financial viability of the business.
4.7 The table below highlights the spend of the key customers, for 2008/9, 2009/10 and 2010/11 financial years, and shows changing turnover patterns during that period.

| Customer | 2008/9 | 2009/10 | 2010/11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Bridgend | £1,325,274.57 | £1,353,170.39 | £1,423,386.15 |
| Caerphilly | £1,278,964.57 | £1,301,075.77 | £1,343,368.26 |
| Merthyr | £367,800.36 | £401,594.69 | £353,097.15 |
| RCT | £2,163,412.52 | £2,136,249.28 | £2,043,510.05 |
| Cardiff/Vale | £180,755.44 | £196,081.94 | £269,452.55 |
| NPT | £2,948.71 | £12,163.71 | £82,241.97 |
| Swansea | £2,127.86 | £77,089.62 | £110,752.75 |
| SW Police | £34,992.73 | £47,335.56 | £2,696.64 |
| Other | £24955.60 | £15498.72 | £32277.70 |
|  | £5,381,232.06 | £5,540,259.68 | £5,660,783.22 |
| Percentage Variation | 0 | +2.955 | +2.175 |

4.8 Turnover growth has been lower than anticipated showing a 2.955 percent increase in 2009/10 and 2.175 percent increase in 2010/11, against the spend analysis indicated.

Whilst in percentage terms, growth in the Neath Port Talbot and Swansea areas is significant, the level of growth has been lower than anticipated, resulting in an
overall turnover level which has declined in real terms, taking account of inflationary pressures.
4.9 A year on year comparison has also been undertaken of product categories, reviewing the income recovery and growth or decline, year on year.

| Product Class | $\begin{gathered} \text { Turnover } \\ 2008 / 9 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Turnover } \\ 2009 / 10 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | ```% Variance 2009/10 to previous year``` | $\begin{gathered} \text { Turnover } \\ 2010 / 11 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | \% <br> Variance 2010/11 to previous year | Income recovery 2010/11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Art \& Craft | £493,638.29 | £511,703.58 | + 3.66 | £577,623.24 | +12.88 | £129,582.79 |
| Audio Visual Machinery | £85,242.74 | £78,154.57 | -8.32 | £72,335.03 | -7.45 | £9,381.44 |
| Books \& Paper | £732,809.15 | £778,573.13 | + 6.25 | £856,779.04 | +10.04 | $£ 121,179.87$ |
| Carpet Curtains \& Textiles | £267,965.92 | £302,278.36 | + 12.80 | £289,513.48 | -4.22 | £53,884.07 |
| Canteen \& Cutlery | £70,058.34 | £84,706.05 | + 20.91 | £68,875.38 | - 18.69 | $£ 17,186.35$ |
| Computer Equipment \& Consumables | £16,405.34 | £15,150.60 | - 7.65 | £15,460.01 | +2.04 | £3,746.63 |
| Electrical Goods \& Equipment | £203,190.95 | £187,152.67 | - 7.89 | £182,992.39 | - 2.22 | £29,117.96 |
| Early Years | £193,198.68 | £171,987.88 | -10.98 | £182,771.10 | + 6.27 | £29,866.04 |
| First Aid Equipment | £143,654.40 | $£ 107,359.72$ | - 25.23 | $£ 124,161.65$ | +15.65 | £44,623.27 |
| Janitorial | $\begin{gathered} £ 1,171,956.0 \\ 5 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | £1,396,567.63 | + 19.17 | £1,345,496.64 | - 3.66 | £324,195.22 |
| Protective Clothing | £86,847.89 | £92,416.59 | + 6.41 | £92,224.89 | -0.21 | $£ 23,784.41$ |
| Residential Furniture | £73,618.97 | £115,349.81 | + 56.68 | £155,978.79 | + 35.22 | $£ 11,594.70$ |
| Sports Clothing <br> \& Equipment | £95,663.51 | £115,971.85 | + 21.23 | £103,062.36 | - 11.13 | £20,771.22 |
| School \& Office Furniture | £939,039.61 | £817,527.53 | - 12.94 | £731,668.12 | - 10.50 | $£ 77,557.76$ |
| Stationery \& Office Machinery | £805,901.83 | £759,739.71 | -5.73 | £861,841.10 | +13.44 | £213,086.99 |
| Miscellaneous | £2,040.39 | £5,620.00 | + 175.44 |  |  |  |
| Total | £5,381,232.06 | £5,540,259.68 | + 2.955 | £5,660,783.22 | +2.175 | £1,109,558.72 |

4.10 It is clear that the more strategic product categories have shown overall growth e.g. art and craft, books and paper, janitorial and stationery and office machinery and these need to be the key focus of business development.

Equally, other areas have shown decline such as Audio visual and electrical and further consideration needs to be given to their longer term viability.

The marketing strategy need to take account of these changing patterns
4.11 The Joint Supplies service benchmarks it's selling prices against key public and private sector competitors and has shown a cost advantage in relation to its customers.
4.12 It is noted that the level of advantage has diminished in the last few years however a recent benchmarking exercise has shown that in most key areas, the service offers a price advantage over its key "one stop shop" competitors, such as AllWales Contracts: The Consortium (Education Curriculum materials), Lyreco (Paper \& Stationery), together with ESPO who are currently supplying some of the former Gwent area.
4.13 The table below summarises the comparison findings:

| Product Group | JSS Annual <br> Turnover | All Wales <br> Contracts | Other Consortia |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Education Curriculum <br> Materials | $£ 894 \mathrm{k}$ | $-21.4 \%(-£ 191 \mathrm{k})$ | $-1 \%(-£ 9 \mathrm{k})$ |
| Paper (core-white) | $£ 372 \mathrm{k}$ | $-11.7 \%(-£ 44 \mathrm{k})$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ |
| Stationery - General | $£ 862 \mathrm{k}$ | $+6.2 \%(+54 \mathrm{k})$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ |
| Furniture \& Associated | $£ 886 \mathrm{k}$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ | $-5.1 \%(-£ 44 \mathrm{k})$ |
| Janitorial | $£ 1,243 \mathrm{k}$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ | $-0.35 \%(-£ 4 \mathrm{k})$ |

It should be noted that Benchmarking is based upon respective supplier published standard catalogue prices only, no inclusion of any 'special offer' pricing other than The Consortium where catalogue prices have been discounted by ten percent to reflect that available though the All-Wales/WPC arrangement.

## Key Findings from Recent Business Process Reviews

4.14 A series of business process reviews were conducted by Officers of Bridgend, Caerphilly, Merthyr Tydfil and Rhondda Cynon Taf Councils, which found a number of areas where the efficiency of the business could be improved.
4.15 The current operating systems are essentially paper based and despite the introduction of web ordering, the fundamentals of internal processing have remained largely unchanged.
> Only 3\% of orders are currently received via the web.
$>$ Customer tend to use a mix of faxed, telephone and emailed order which in turn have to be input and be processed manually
> The manual processes extend to all of the work areas reviewed including the picking of orders, delivery processes, receipt, ordering delivery of order and
invoicing processes and these should be all integrated with the front facing system
> The volume of processing is time consuming and does not provide the flexibility and management systems that can be afforded by electronic systems
$>$ the web capture of orders could also be improved to ensure all information is competed at the point of first order to avoid further telephone call and correspondence to clarify details
4.16 The current catalogue has a large array of products, many of which perform the same function. Joint Supplies therefore needs to contract for each product range represented which is time consuming, costly and takes up catalogue and warehouse space. There are options to rationalise amongst local authorities and schools to reduce the catalogue of products managed
4.17 Delivery and Distribution could be made more efficient. There are opportunities to further review current delivery patterns to maximise the efficiency of deliveries. Whilst minimum order levels (or charges for express or small orders) may help to reduce the volume of delivery the delivery 'windows' provided by schools could also be extended but this would need to be agreed with customers.
4.18 There is no restriction on order values or on urgent requirements which can be disruptive, costly to process and deliver. This inefficiency by default will extend to procurement and the sourcing of ad hoc items.
4.19 The purchasing of non-catalogue items take a disproportionate time to source and will tie up the resources of staff. Similarly, the current tendering process is manual and labour intensive, particularly when issuing and analysing bid submissions.
4.20 The Officer Group have identified that significant opportunities exist for County Borough Supplies to streamline its processes and deliver efficiencies. A number of those opportunities do not require substantial or indeed any initial investment.
4.21 However, in order to be sustainable in the longer term and compete effectively with its private sector competitors, Joint Supplies will need to consider adopting a fully integrated electronic business solution. This would need to be fully appraised and funded from existing balances.
4.22 The recommendations of the Officer Group are set out in appendix 1.

## The National Agenda for Procurement in Wales

4.23 Members will be aware of the work undertaken by the Efficiency and Innovation Board which is looking at service improvements for Procurement across the Welsh Public Sector.

One of the key recommendations is the creation of a national procurement service with a harmonised and centralised approach to the procurement of common and repetitive spend. Whilst there are a number of options for the delivery of this which have yet to be agreed and implemented, it is clear that many of the commodity areas currently offered by the Joint Supplies Service, are common across the Welsh Public Sector.
4.24 There will be renewed emphasis on establishing direct supply collaborative framework contracts for common and repetitive spend and the marketing of these through the Xchange Wales hub is likely to put further pressure on the current trading position.
4.25 Whilst this could potentially present a business opportunity, it is clear that the current infrastructure could not cope with delivering a service to a much wider customer base. Other organisations such as Welsh Health Supplies may be better suited to this approach.

## Other Considerations

4.26 Recent condition surveys of the building that the Joint Supplies Service occupies have highlighted concern about its long term longevity. At present the building is jointly occupied with some Bridgend CBC services, although the JSS accounts for the largest percentage of floor footage. Whilst the office accommodation is in reasonable condition, the purpose built stores has major structural problems in relation to the roof which, given the age of the building, is not economically viable to repair.
4.27 At present, the Joint Supplies Service pays a proportion of the overall building costs which amounted to $£ 96,000$ for 2009/10 financial year.
4.29 The stores roof may not be sustainable in the medium term which could potentially mean that the operation would have to be relocated. The net cost for relocation would be subject to several factors, but as an indicative projection, this costs is estimated to range from $£ 65 \mathrm{k}$ and $£ 90 \mathrm{k}$ per annum.
4.30 Bridgend County Borough Council has recently undertaken a job evaluation scheme, the outcome of which will affect staff employed within the Joint Supplies Service. The results of the process are not yet known and no provision has been included within the budget estimates for any additional costs.

## Options Appraisal

4.31 Given the current trading position, other options need to be explored.
These are outlined below:

- Standstill - Continue to provide the service as is, monitoring turnover and income
- Modernise the service in line with the recommendations of the business process review (see appendix 1), either :
i) In part where no additional costs are incurred
ii) In full, following the production of a robust business case
- Explore options to partner with Welsh Health Supplies
- Develop an exit strategy with a phased closure, any residual costs being borne as determined within JSS Constitution.


## 5. Effect upon Policy Framework and Procedure Rules

5.1 None.
6. Equalities Impact Assessment
6.1 None

## 7. Financial Implications

7.1 All of the options outlined in 4.31 will to a greater or lesser extent impact on the financing of the Joint Committee's operations and potentially the constituent Councils. It is clear that if the decision is to standstill the operation will become less competitive and over time any associated closure costs will escalate.
7.2 The Joint Supplies building is in a poor state of repair and there is a possibility that if the building deteriorates suddenly, alternative accommodation would have to be sourced at short notice which would place increased pressure on the trading account.
8. Recommendation
8.1 The Committee is asked to consider this report and discuss a future strategy for the organisation.

## David MacGregor,

Assistant Chief Executive - Performance
Contact Officers: James Ferris
Group Manager - Procurement
Telephone: (01656) 664506
E-mail: James.Ferris@bridgend.gov.uk
Phil Hughes
County Borough Supplies Manager
Telephone: (01656) 664505
E-mail: Phillip.Hughes@bridgend.gov.uk

## Background Documents

Buying Smarter in Tougher Times - Conclusions and Recommendations of the

EIB Procurement Taskforce

## Recommendations of The Officer Group Following the Business Process Reviews Conducted in January 2011

Officers have shared and discussed in detail the reports and an action plan has been formulated to take forward the recommendations(attached as appendix1)

1. Maximise the use of the web ordering system and integrate these order processes with back office systems to support the business. Develop the integration with Schools Information Management Systems to the Joint Supplies web.
2. Explore the options for the management of small and urgent orders to minimise the disruption to Joint Supplies of these orders and lower the costs of these processes.
3. Explore options for increasing the delivery windows to meet customers requirements
4. Utilise Marketing Strategies to include for maximisation of electronic ordering and use of purchase cards for transactions and to generally sustain or grow the levels of turnover
5. Maximise the use of e-ordering and purchasing systems for the business for it own stock and ad hoc purchasing and payment of invoices
6. Rationalise the variety of similar products stocked through discussion with customers and officers
7. Member local authorities consider punch out systems from their own Xchange Wales systems so that Joint Supplies will no longer need to maintain catalogues on its web and within the Xchange Wales system. This would also include minimising invoice transactional costs by means of e-invoicing, consolidation of invoicing or use of purchase cards
8. Develop KPI's to monitor the progress to electronic processing and delivery of the action plan for ongoing reporting to Joint Committee

Appendix 2
Turnover Breakdown by Customer Department - 2010/11 $2010 / 11$ Financial Year stats

| Level 1 | Level 2 | Bridgend | Caerphilly | Merthyr Tydfil | RCT | Blaenau Gwent | Cardiff | Gwent | Neath Port Talbot | Newport | Torfaen | Swansea | Vale of Glam | Other |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Education | Secondary | £219,963.36 | £195,174.53 | £47,060.32 | £335,401.23 | £901.30 | £47,709.23 | £0.00 | £13,956.71 | £2,776.72 | £0.00 | £52,475.98 | £18,582.64 | £0.00 |
|  | Primary | £453,629.39 | £464,265.93 | £143,231.36 | £664,361.10 | £5,405.28 | £136,334.50 | £0.00 | £67,482.62 | £7,712.27 | $£ 0.00$ | £54,212.48 | £64,172.48 | £404.80 |
|  | Nursery | £4,801.93 | $£ 0.00$ | £6,384.17 | £5,239.28 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Other | £21,439.24 | £32,733.85 | £3,461.02 | £52,039.52 | $£ 0.00$ | £183.57 | £0.00 | £460.28 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £425.94 | £879.38 |
|  |  | £699,833.92 | £692,174.31 | £200,136.87 | $£ 1,057,041.13$ | £6,306.58 | £184,227.30 | £0.00 | £81,899.61 | £10,488.99 | £0.00 | £106,688.46 | £83,181.06 | £1,284.18 |
|  | Chief |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| CBC | Executives Direct | £3,078.85 | £2,473.88 | £10,210.17 | £1,813.95 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Services | £146,808.37 | £204,991.07 | £40,667.04 | $£ 109,032.24$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Education | £35,196.88 | £50,445.70 | £2,743.53 | £89,731.44 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £171.10 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £859.41 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Environmental | £7,462.28 | £3,239.39 | £0.00 | £25,165.49 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Finance Highways \& | £5,837.96 | £23,488.26 | $£ 0.00$ | £22,530.64 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Trans | £20,282.54 | £385.22 | £2,368.20 | £12,656.78 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | IT | £51,838.13 | £1,105.04 | $£ 0.00$ | £845.15 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Legal Leisure | £4,337.89 | £560.65 | £0.00 | £5,808.41 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Services | £21,635.07 | £27,275.25 | £319.36 | £49,507.75 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £329.62 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Library | £6,120.78 | £5,712.33 | £1,030.25 | £16,031.31 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Other <br> Social <br> Services | £134,762.00 | £153,533.55 | £40,601.49 | £183,100.03 | $£ 0.00$ | £115.80 | £374.20 | £73.40 | £442.39 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £308.80 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £223,465.17 | £160,747.38 | £41,742.49 | £420,554.28 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £5,296.98 | £0.00 | £739.83 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Technical | $£ 0.00$ | £117.85 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £660,825.92 | £634,075.57 | £139,682.53 | £936,777.47 | $£ 0.00$ | £115.80 | £374.20 | £244.50 | £6,068.99 | £0.00 | £1,599.24 | £308.80 | £0.00 |
| Outside |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Authority | Careers | £878.42 | £848.27 | £231.72 | £2,776.49 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Colleges | £16,021.58 | £1,925.82 | £4,685.49 | £6,499.19 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £2,272.53 |
|  | Miscellaneous | £29,597.71 | £12,085.35 | £7,130.15 | £35,502.91 | £0.00 | £623.85 | £527.93 | £97.86 | £1,089.01 | £1,076.08 | £2,179.22 | £0.00 | £2,789.21 |
|  | Playgroups | £5,641.90 | £2,238.44 | £1,230.39 | £3,140.21 | $£ 0.00$ | £108.86 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Probation South Wales Police | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 466.79$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £10,579.30 | $£ 20.50$ | $£ 0.00$ | £382.79 | $£ 0.00$ | £801.02 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £285.83 | £0.00 | £2,696.64 |
|  | University | $£ 7.40$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £923.07 | $£ 0.00$ | £85.86 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £62,726.31 | £17,118.38 | £13,277.75 | £49,691.45 | $£ 0.00$ | £1,619.59 | $£ 527.93$ | $£ 97.86$ | £1,089.01 | $£ 1,076.08$ | £2,465.05 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 7,758.38$ |
| GrandTotal |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | £1,423,386.15 | £1,343,368.26 | £353,097.15 | £2,043,510.05 | £6,306.58 | £185,962.69 | $£ 902.13$ | £82,241.97 | £17,646.99 | $£ 1,076.08$ | $£ 110,752.75$ | £83,489.86 | £9,042.56 |

[^0]
## Turnover Breakdown by Customer Department - 2009/10

| Level 1 | Level 2 | Bridgend | Caerphilly | Merthyr Tydfil | RCT | Blaenau Gwent | Cardif / Vale | Carmart henshire | Gwent | Neath Port Talbot | Newport | Swansea | Torfaen | Other |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Education | Secondary | £203,564.94 | £217,066.60 | £71,313.56 | £310,069.05 | £142.40 | £67,434.15 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £827.34 | £1,400.86 | £51,116.10 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Primary | £404,680.09 | £475,544.70 | £188,215.91 | £644,579.56 | £1,564.60 | £119,895.83 | £225.69 | £0.00 | £10,960.45 | £1,768.25 | £22,506.50 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Nursery | £2,342.20 | £0.00 | £4,981.20 | £3,284.86 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Other | £31,302.00 | £25,873.54 | £2,698.40 | £63,124.28 | £0.00 | £149.54 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £157.00 | £0.00 | £1,078.37 | £0.00 | £304.48 |
|  |  | £641,889.23 | £718,484.84 | £267,209.07 | £1,021,057.75 | £1,707.00 | £187,479.52 | £225.69 | $£ 0.00$ | £11,944.79 | £3,169.11 | £74,700.97 | $£ 0.00$ | £304.48 |
| CBC | Chief |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Executives Direct | £3,347.99 | £1,422.59 | £12,312.15 | £1,210.65 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Services | £158,481.75 | £180,309.75 | £12,939.00 | £80,959.57 | £0.00 | $£ 120.35$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Education Environmen tal | £77,420.16 | £47,759.07 | £3,277.84 | £177,434.73 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £88.42 |
|  |  | £1,851.64 | £4,814.96 | $£ 0.00$ | £31,272.01 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Finance Highways \& Trans | £14,952.56 | £18,870.89 | £0.00 | £42,694.26 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £5,623.75 | £1,887.46 | £64.20 | £11,217.55 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | IT | £28,420.16 | £560.84 | £0.00 | £2,977.56 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Legal Leisure Services | £19,344.01 | £462.49 | £0.00 | £8,066.59 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £17,577.09 | £18,958.19 | £0.00 | £25,295.53 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Libraries | £7,002.83 | £6,403.04 | £692.30 | £12,493.26 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Other <br> Social <br> Services | £85,598.57 | £130,652.47 | £41,185.72 | £177,917.89 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 42.00$ | $£ 73.08$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  |  | £181,118.19 | £152,550.98 | £43,577.82 | £490,525.38 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £1,554.36 | £650.31 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Technical | £23.94 | $£ 7.86$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  |  | £600,762.64 | £564,660.59 | £114,049.03 | £1,062,064.98 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 120.35$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 42.00$ | $£ 73.08$ | £1,554.36 | £650.31 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 88.42$ |
| Outside |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Authority | Careers | £1,912.58 | £1,095.61 | £3,327.93 | £2,676.05 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Colleges Miscellaneo us | £35,840.03 | £1,576.50 | £2,631.79 | £6,858.60 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £2,898.27 |
|  |  | £33,628.42 | £14,201.55 | £8,548.49 | £29,990.55 | £0.00 | £4,878.18 | £0.00 | £756.78 | £145.84 | £0.00 | £1,595.84 | £1,276.11 | £3,476.50 |
|  | Playgroups | £4,656.06 | £884.52 | £1,201.39 | £3,340.17 | £0.00 | $£ 142.59$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Probation South Wales | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £427.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Police | £34,481.43 | £172.16 | £4,626.99 | £6,303.91 | £0.00 | £2,165.74 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £142.50 | £0.00 | £47,335.56 |
|  | University | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £3,530.27 | £0.00 | £1,295.56 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  |  | £110,518.52 | £17,930.34 | £20,336.59 | £53,126.55 | $£ 0.00$ | £8,482.07 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 756.78$ | £145.84 | $£ 0.00$ | £1,738.34 | £1,276.11 | £53,710.33 |
| Grand |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total |  | £1,353,170.39 | £1,301,075.77 | £401,594.69 | £2,136,249.28 | £1,707.00 | £196,081.94 | $£ 225.69$ | $£ 798.78$ | £12,163.71 | £4,723.47 | £77,089.62 | £1,276.11 | £54,103.23 |

Appendix 4
Turnover Breakdown by Customer Department - 2008/09

| Level 1 | Level 2 | Bridgend | Caerphilly | Merthyr Tydfil | RCT | Blaenau Gwent | Cardiff / Vale | Carmarth enshire | Gwent | Neath Port Talbot | Newport | Monmout hshire | Swansea | Other |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Education | Secondary | £212,448.40 | £231,581.70 | £82,352.43 | £356,655.27 | £2,249.13 | $\begin{aligned} & £ 60,669.30 \\ & £ 111,130.0 \end{aligned}$ | $£ 972.94$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £7,981.71 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 547.38$ | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Primary | £325,674.23 | £419,811.88 | £175,322.91 | £606,148.16 | £0.00 | 9 | $£ 0.00$ | £1,404.20 | £2,887.11 | £1,674.57 | £215.33 | £1,580.48 | £0.00 |
|  | Nursery | £3,044.21 | £0.00 | £6,862.85 | £9,121.37 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 |
|  | Other | £35,299.25 | £29,937.90 | £2,451.29 | £83,842.65 | £0.00 | £727.84 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  |  | £576,466.09 | £681,331.48 | £266,989.48 | £1,055,767.45 | £2,249.13 | £172,527.23 | £972.94 | £1,404.20 | £2,887.11 | £9,656.28 | £215.33 | £2,127.86 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Chief |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| CBC | Executives <br> Direct | £2,797.10 | £2,053.76 | £1,979.38 | £5,699.52 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ |
|  | Services | £157,756.61 | £175,423.91 | $£ 0.00$ | £82,703.18 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Education Environmen | £46,508.92 | £141,113.89 | £3,080.18 | £169,556.64 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | tal | £6,084.03 | £6,693.73 | $£ 0.00$ | £27,394.86 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Finance Highways \& | £5,894.55 | £15,819.64 | £0.00 | £75,126.20 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Trans | £5,559.54 | $£ 0.00$ | £86.44 | £17,328.84 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | IT | £12,546.10 | £1,049.96 | £0.62 | £947.08 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Legal Leisure | £54,621.98 | £157.66 | £0.00 | $£ 5,730.57$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Services | £28,396.70 | £15,399.26 | £739.42 | £19,528.92 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Libraries | £10,547.55 | £4,985.29 | £489.01 | £9,945.19 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Other Social | £123,045.88 | £68,760.82 | £15,564.12 | £224,503.13 | £0.00 | £1,580.55 | $£ 0.00$ | £253.70 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £4,709.78 |
|  | Services Social | £74,708.68 | £70,760.25 | £23,016.66 | £158,242.93 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £2,274.17 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Services | £93,369.69 | £70,284.75 | £37,487.43 | £246,063.54 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Technical | £428.35 | £170.42 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  |  | £622,265.68 | £572,673.34 | £82,443.26 | £1,042,770.60 | $£ 0.00$ | £1,580.55 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 253.70$ | $£ 0.00$ | £2,274.17 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 |  |
| Outside |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Authority | Careers | £849.34 | £1,256.09 | £239.87 | £2,309.94 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Colleges Miscellaneo | £50,811.16 | £2,095.99 | £3,197.23 | £8,890.56 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 3,056.98$ |
|  | us | £34,702.01 | £17,974.07 | £9,084.54 | £37,633.37 | £0.00 | £5,058.61 | £0.00 | £204.06 | £61.60 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £4,555.00 |
|  | Playgroups | £3,987.17 | £2,199.96 | £961.99 | £2,729.79 | £0.00 | £103.88 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 |
|  | Probation South Wales | £482.85 | $£ 0.00$ | £502.10 | £1,269.23 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £10.01 |
|  | Police | £35,161.23 | £1,433.64 | £4,381.89 | £7,867.38 | £0.00 | £1,462.02 | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £103.50 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £34,992.73 |
|  | University | £549.04 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £4,174.20 | £0.00 | £23.15 | £0.00 | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ | £0.00 | £0.00 | $£ 0.00$ |
|  |  | £126,542.80 | £24,959.75 | £18,367.62 | £64,874.47 | $£ 0.00$ | £6,647.66 | $£ 0.00$ | £204.06 | £61.60 | $£ 103.50$ | $£ 0.00$ | $£ 0.00$ | £42,614.72 |
| GrandTotal |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | £1,325,274.57 | £1,278,964.57 | £367,800.36 | £2,163,412.52 | £2,249.13 | £180,755.44 | $£ 972.94$ | $£ 1,861.96$ | £2,948.71 | £12,033.95 | £215.33 | £2,127.86 | £42,614.72 |


[^0]:    £5,660,783.22

